Using the “Additional Indicator” Under ESSA to Drive College and Career Readiness:
Prioritizing Multiple Pathways and Employability Skills

The webinar will begin shortly.
Using the “Additional Indicator” Under ESSA to Drive College and Career Readiness: Prioritizing Multiple Pathways and Employability Skills

October 31, 2016
Mission

The mission of the College and Career Readiness and Success Center (CCRS Center) is to foster the capacity of vibrant networks of practitioners, researchers, innovators, and experts to build and sustain a system of support for states as they implement strategies to improve college and career readiness and eventual success of their students.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>State Education Agencies (SEAs)</td>
<td>Build SEA capacity to implement college- and career-readiness policies.</td>
<td>Provide technical assistance including targeted and intensive support.</td>
<td>Support SEAs to plan for and implement the Every Students Succeeds Act.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

www.ccrscenter.org  CCRSCenter@air.org
The College and Career Readiness and Success Center

- Career readiness
- Postsecondary pathways
- Data use
- ESSA implications for CCR
Engaging With Us

Post-event feedback survey

Recorded webinar
http://www.ccrscenter.org/products-resources/ccrs-center-webinars-events
Today’s Presenters

Susan Therriault, EdD, Director, CCRS Center

Ryan Reyna, Senior Associate, Education Strategy Group

Nick Yoder, PhD, Senior Consultant, Center on Great Teacher and Leaders

*Moderator:*
David English, Accountability Content Lead, CCRS Center
Every Student Succeeds Act, 2015: Additional Indicator of School Quality or Student Success

David English, Accountability Content Lead, CCRS Center
Poll:
Which of the following measure(s) are you considering as an “additional indicator” of school quality or student success under ESSA?
Accountability Indicators Under ESSA

- Proficiency on statewide math and reading/ELA tests
- Graduation rate (high schools)
  Growth or another academic indicator (elementary/middle)
- Progress toward English language proficiency
- Additional indicator of school quality or student success

Required academic indicators weighted “much greater” in aggregate than additional indicator.
Additional Indicator of School Quality or Student Success

**ESSA statute:** Valid, reliable, comparable, statewide (same measures by grade span), can be disaggregated, allows for meaningful differentiation. Measures may include the following:

- Student engagement [e.g., chronic absenteeism]
- Educator engagement
- Student access to and completion of advanced coursework
- Postsecondary readiness
- School climate and safety
- Any other indicator that meets technical requirements

**Pending rules:** Research demonstrates “likely” positive impact on student outcomes and demonstrates “varied results” across schools.
Accountability:
Prioritizing Multiple Pathways and Employability Skills

1. Align state education goals and accountability.
2. Consider role of CCR/SEL in accountability in broad context (this dictates stakes):
   - Reporting
   - Identification of low-performing schools
   - Improvement/needs assessment/diagnosis
   - Evaluation/monitoring
Accountability: Prioritizing Multiple Pathways and Employability Skills

3. Incorporate measures that prioritize the following:
   - **Multiple pathways** – academic and career/technical success
   - **Employability skills** – interpersonal/intrapersonal, problem-solving, etc.

4. Measure-level considerations include validity, complexity, transparency, fairness, and actionability in the context of the stakes involved.
Making College and Career Readiness Meaningful in State ESSA Accountability Systems

Ryan Reyna, Senior Associate, Education Strategies Group
Poll:
Which, if any, of the following college and career readiness measure(s) are you considering as an “additional indicator” of school quality or student success under ESSA?
Accountability Leads to CCR Outcomes

What get’s measured, gets valued.

- Kentucky included college, career and college + career measures in accountability in 2011–12.
- Schools receive bonus points for % of students college + career.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Career Ready Only</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2011–2012</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012–2013</td>
<td>11.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013–2014</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014–2015</td>
<td>20.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>College + Career Ready</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2011–2012</td>
<td>13.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012–2013</td>
<td>18.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013–2014</td>
<td>26.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014–2015</td>
<td>32.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
State Approaches to Measuring College and Career Readiness
Roles of College and Career Readiness Measures

1. **Public/private reporting** – Provide stakeholders with a clear picture of students’ preparation for education and training beyond high school. This reporting occurs through school report cards, early warning dashboards, high school feedback reports, etc.

2. **Formal accountability** – Differentiate schools based on school performance. Based on the differentiation, provide appropriate supports, rewards, and consequences.

3. **System improvement** – Identify gaps and develop solutions based on access and success data. As a result of data analysis, educators, administrators, and state officials can work together to devise policy supports and showcase best practices.
Measures That Recognize Multiple Pathways

Progress Toward Post-High School Credential

Co-Curricular Learning and Leadership Experiences

Assessment of Readiness

Transitions Beyond High School

All Students
Potential measures for the “Additional Indicator”

- Progress toward post-high school credential (~20 states)
  - *Examples:* AP/IB classes, dual enrollment, CTE coursework, advanced diploma

- Learning and leadership experiences (~10 states)
  - *Examples:* work-based learning, industry-recognized credentials

- Assessment of readiness (~25 states)
  - *Examples:* SAT, ACT, PSAT, ACT Aspire, SAT subject tests, AP, IB, technical skills assessment

- Transitions beyond high school (~7 states)
  - *Examples:* enrollment in college, college remedial course enrollment, military enrollment
Career Readiness and Accountability: Some Positive Trends

- Majority of states (32) include at least one career-readiness indicator in reporting or formal accountability.
- Of those states, 20 make career-readiness indicators count in their accountability formulas or as bonus points.
- Dual enrollment and postsecondary enrollment are most prevalent.

Source: Advance CTE and Achieve, How States are Making Career Readiness Count: A 2016 Update
Career Readiness and Accountability: Challenges

- Very few states include career measures with predictive validity.
- Career measures are hidden in “metaindicators” in many systems.
- Denominators vary across indicators, especially within reporting that focuses exclusively on CTE students.
- Data collection and validation hurdles remain.

Source: Advance CTE and Achieve, How States are Making Career Readiness Count: A 2016 Update
Measure-level Considerations for Embedding CCR in Accountability
Measure-level Considerations for Embedding CCR in Accountability

1. Measurement
   - Data availability
   - Cohort
   - Meaningful differentiation
   - Predictive capability

2. Actionability
   - Aggregation of multiple measures
   - Measuring readiness – progress and/or outcome?
   - Availability of supports
Measure-level Considerations for Embedding CCR in Accountability

3. Transparency and Validity
   • Quality – rigor of experiences and data
   • Performance expectations

4. Fairness
   • Access
   • Participation versus performance

5. Political
   • College and career readiness
   • How to address within ESSA guardrails?
Make College and Career Readiness Meaningful in Accountability

- Include 1+ measure of CCR in “additional” indicator
  - Measure(s) account for students’ development of academic, technical, and professional skills.
  - Place significant weight on the measure.

- Establish clear college and career readiness goals aligned to state’s postsecondary and workforce needs.

- Report disaggregated measures of the following:
  - Student progressions through middle and high school.
  - Student transitions and long-term outcomes in postsecondary education, training, and the workforce
Social and Emotional Learning, School Climate, and ESSA

Nick Yoder, PhD, Senior Consultant, Great Teachers and Leaders Center
Objectives

- Defining the importance of SEL and school climate
- SEL, School Climate, and ESSA
- Measurement and Accountability
- Example State and District Practice
Defining the Importance of SEL and School Climate
Defining SEL

- SEL is composed of multiple skills and competencies that individuals need to be successful in school, work, and life.

- Social and emotional learning is the process of developing and using the skills, attitudes, and knowledge that help youth and adults (Collaborative for Academic, Social, and Emotional Learning [CASEL], 2013).
  - Identify and regulate emotions.
  - Develop positive relationships.
  - Make responsible decisions.

- SEL is a universal intervention.
  - Help build the foundation at schools.
Social and Emotional Competencies and Skills
Other Frameworks

- Office of Career, Technical and Adult Education (OCTAE) Employability Skills
- Foundation for Young Adult Success (University of Chicago)
- Partnership for 21st Century Skills
- Quality Youth Development
- 11 Principles of Character Education (Character.org)
- Achieve-Connect-Thrive (ACT) Skills Framework
- Positive Youth Development
Importance of SEL

Increases Students’ Capacity to Learn

- Social-Emotional Skills (22nd percentile)
- Positive Attitudes (ninth percentile)
- Prosocial Behaviors (ninth percentile)
- Academic Achievement (11th percentile)
- Conduct Problems (ninth percentile)
- Emotional Distress (10th percentile)

Source: Durlak, Weissberg, Dymnicki, Taylor, and Schellinger (2011)
Importance of SEL

Is Important for Life Outcomes

Teachers’ ratings of student social and emotional competence at kindergarten, predicts…

Increased likelihood

- On-time high school graduation
- Graduation from college
- Full-time job by age 25

Decreased likelihood

- Involvement with police before adulthood
- Being arrested
- On wait list for public housing
- Receiving public assistance

Source: Jones, Greenberg, and Crowley (2015)
Introduction to School Climate

- Refers to the quality and character of school life
- Is based on patterns of students’, parents’, and school personnel’s experience of school life
- Reflects norms, goals, values, interpersonal relationships, teaching and learning practices, and organizational structures
Model of School Climate

Source: U.S. Department of Education School Climate Surveys (EDSCLS) model of school climate
Conditions for Learning

**Students are safe**
- Physically safe
- Emotionally and socially safe
- Treated fairly and equitably
- Safe and orderly school

**Students are supported**
- Meaningful connection to adults
- Strong bonds to school
- Positive peer relationships
- Effective and available support

**Students are challenged**
- High expectations
- Strong personal motivation
- School connected to life goals
- Rigorous academic opportunities

**Students are socially capable**
- Emotionally intelligent and culturally competent
- Responsible and persistent
- Cooperative team players
- Avoidance of risky behaviors
- Contribution to school and community

*Source: Osher, D. (2010)*
Outcomes Related to Improved School Climate

- Improved test scores
- Improved graduation rates
- Improved school safety
- Improved student attendance
- Reduced dropout rate
- Improved working environment (student-teacher and peer relationships)
- Higher rates of teacher satisfaction

SEL, School Climate, and ESSA
SEL in ESSA

How does SEL fit within ESSA, broadly?

- Provides a broader definition of student success
- Supports the development of a positive learning environment
- Broadens Title I funds to support well-rounded education
- Broadens suggested professional learning experiences
- Suggests broader school improvement strategies
- Other (e.g., 21st Century Learning Community Learning Centers)

Source: Aspen Education and Society Program and CCSSO (2016); Osher and Shriver (2016)
Measurement and Accountability
Role of Accountability Measures

Reasons to include indicators within the state accountability and improvement system:

- Identification
- Diagnostic
- Continuous improvement

Source: Darling-Hammond, Bae, Cook-Harvey, Lam, Mercer, Podolsky & Stosich (2016).
Measure-Level Considerations

Criteria to consider:
- Purpose/role
- Measurable
- Transparent
- Fairness
- Actionable
- Meaningful

Source: Darling-Hammond, Bae, Cook-Harvey, Lam, Mercer, Podolsky & Stosich (2016); American Institutes for Research (2015).
As we think of SEL assessments, let’s consider the following:

- Reliable and valid assessments of student social and emotional competence exist, but they must be used wisely.
- Social and emotional competence measurement is influenced by multiple factors (e.g., reference bias or personal factors).
- Social and emotional competence measures tend to vary across ages and genders.
- Direct measures of student social and emotional skills may be problematic for accountability.

What Are Some Possibilities for Social and Emotional Measurement?

Use of input measures

- School climate or conditions for learning (e.g., U.S. Department of Education School Climate Survey [EDSCLS])
- Teacher practices (e.g., common observation instruments or student surveys)

Student participation measures as one of multiple measures

- Attendance rates / chronic absenteeism
- Disciplinary referrals
- Suspension/expulsion rates
- Graduation rates

Source: Darling-Hammond and colleagues (2016); Osher & Shriver (2016).
State and District Policy
K–12 Social and Emotional Learning Standards and Supports

- Freestanding K–12 SEL Standards
- Comprehensive standards with developmental benchmarks for early elementary
- Provide resources on SEL
- Collaborating Districts Initiative (CDI)
District Accountability Example

Domain Weights for CORE School Quality Improvement Systems

Source: Darling-Hammond et al. (2016)
## Georgia School Climate Star Rating

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Survey</th>
<th>Student Discipline</th>
<th>Safe and Substance-Free Learning Environment</th>
<th>Attendance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• GA Student Health Survey 2.0</td>
<td>• Weighted Suspension Rates</td>
<td>• School Discipline Incidents</td>
<td>• Average Daily Attendance of Teachers, Administrators, and Staff Member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• GA School Personnel Survey</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Student Survey Responses of Unsafe Incidents</td>
<td>• Percentage of Students With Fewer Than Six Unexcused Absences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• GA Parent Survey</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source: Georgia Department of Education (n.d.)*
Resources
Predictors of Postsecondary Readiness

The purpose of this brief is to provide information to state, district, and school personnel seeking support to determine whether their students are on a path to postsecondary success. The College and Career Readiness and Success Center (CCRS Center) has received technical assistance requests from a number of states regarding factors that predict postsecondary success, and this brief summarizes and expands on the information shared with those states. Specifically, we summarize early childhood through early postsecondary education research that identifies student skills, behaviors, and other characteristics that predict future academic and workplace success. We have attempted to focus on a variety of measures drawn from readily available data that schools, districts, and states are likely to have. Through this information, policymakers and practitioners can begin to inform the development and validation of factors to identify students who are not on a path to postsecondary success, as early as preschool and as late as their senior year of high school. These factors can inform practice and can be integrated into a longitudinal tracking mechanism to identify and monitor individual students who may need additional resources or supports at any point during their schooling. In addition, tracking and measuring factors of success across preschool through early postsecondary education offer a prime opportunity to develop and evaluate systemwide improvement efforts. For example, these data may help identify particular grades, schools, or subgroups of students (e.g., English language learners) that need additional support, enabling both school and district personnel to develop and monitor the impact of policies, programs, or interventions designed to improve outcomes for targeted groups or for the system in general.

General Approach

We began our review of the research looking for studies that identify measures of postsecondary success. Our goal was to identify factors at all levels of education that predict future academic attainment and economic security. Not surprisingly, we found very few studies that link early childhood, elementary, or middle school characteristics with postsecondary success. Even at the secondary level, the limited research linking secondary characteristics to postsecondary readiness and success focuses primarily on course taking, test scores, and early postsecondary outcomes, such as college enrollment and attainment of industry certification. The fact that state longitudinal data systems have not been in existence long enough to support such analyses is
From “Predictors of Postsecondary Success”

Table 2. Elementary School Correlates of Elementary and Middle Grades Success and Secondary Readiness

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elementary School Indicator</th>
<th>Predictor</th>
<th>Other Potential Factor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reading by the third grade&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>Being rated highly by teachers on attention span and classroom participation&lt;sup&gt;c&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>Social competence&lt;sup&gt;e&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&lt; 10 percent absenteeism in elementary school&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>High scores on the Social Skills Rating System&lt;sup&gt;d&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sup>a</sup>The Annie E. Casey Foundation, 2010; Hernandez, 2012; <sup>b</sup>Chang & Maria Jose, 2008; <sup>c</sup>Alexander, Entwisle, & Dauber, 1993; <sup>d</sup>Malecki & Elliot, 2002; <sup>e</sup>Welsh, Parke, Widaman, & O’Neil, 2001
Leveraging ESSA to Support State Visions for College and Career Readiness

States continue to position college and career readiness (CCR) at the center of their educational strategies. Many states have formulated multidimensional definitions of CCR that are supported by key educational inputs including curricula, conditions for learning, accountability systems, and assessments. To operationalize a strong overall CCR vision, the state’s CCR definition and these inputs should be closely aligned (see Figure 1). The Every Student Succeeds Act of 2015 (ESSA) provides additional leverage for these alignment efforts beyond that of the No Child Left Behind Act of 2002 (NCLB) by more meaningfully incorporating the various academic and nonacademic components of state CCR definitions.

This brief presents a policy framework to support states’ efforts to move their CCR visions forward in a cohesive manner. The framework is grouped according to three closely interrelated policy areas under ESSA:

- Provision of a well-rounded education that emphasizes readiness beyond NCLB’s focus on core academic content via enriched, accelerated curricula and educational experiences and improved conditions for learning.
- Augmentation of accountability systems to include multiple measures that may form a continuous measure of academic and nonacademic measures of readiness from preschool to the workforce.

State definitions of CCR include the following skills, knowledge, and dispositions. ESSA meaningfully incorporates many of these academic and nonacademic student outcomes:

- Academic knowledge (10 states’ definitions)
- Critical thinking and/or problem-solving skills such as analysis, inference, and evaluation (14 states)
- Social and emotional skills such as collaboration, personal awareness, and responsible decision-making (14 states)
- Intersocial skills such as goal, resilience, and perseverance (9 states)
- Citizenship and/or community involvement (8 states)
- Other employability skills (6 states)

Delaware’s CCR definition exemplifies states’ multidimensional approach to CCR:

“Each Delaware student will graduate college- and career-ready. Students will be prepared to successfully plan and pursue an education and career path aligned to their personal goals, with the ability to adapt and to innovate as job demands change. Students will graduate with strong academic knowledge, the behaviors and skills with which to apply their knowledge, and the ability to collaborate and communicate effectively. Each student should be an independent learner, and have respect for a diverse society and a commitment to responsible citizenship.”

Source: Markled, 2014

Source: http://www.ccrscenter.org/sites/default/files/AskCCRS_LeveragingESSA.pdf
From “Leveraging ESSA to Support CCR”

State vision for CCR:

[Diagram showing the State Vision for College and Career Readiness as Expressed by State CCR Definition and Aligned Policies Under ESSA.]

- Well-Rounded Education
  - Enriched, accelerated curricula and educational experiences
  - Improved conditions for learning

- Purposeful Assessment
  - Balanced assessment systems
  - Design and delivery for meaningful results
  - Measuring nonacademic readiness

- Multiple-Measure Accountability
  - Multiple measures of CCR
  - Continuum of readiness indicators
  - Usable data

- State CCR Definition
  - Academic readiness
  - Nonacademic readiness

Inform and align

State Vision for College and Career Readiness as Expressed by State CCR Definition and Aligned Policies Under ESSA.
How States are Making Career Readiness Count: A 2016 Update

Which Career-Ready Indicators Are Found in State Accountability Systems?

States include a variety of indicators related to career readiness in their accountability systems.

- **Most often**, states include a measure of dual enrollment. **Fourteen states** include dual enrollment participation and/or success.

- **Eleven states** include industry certification (e.g., the percentage of students earning an industry credential/certificate).

- **Seven states** (Connecticut, Delaware, Georgia, Maryland, New Mexico, Oklahoma, and Texas) include **course pathways** (e.g., the percentage of students completing a secondary **CTE pathway** or completing a CTE **program of study**).
ARE YOU READY to Assess Social and Emotional Development?

and learn about the assessment landscape.

about assessment purpose, rigor, practicality, burden, and ethics.

with confidence to choose the right assessments or alternative solutions.

*Ready to Assess: Stop. Think. Act.* Is a suite of tools that can help education leaders, practitioners, and policymakers decide whether and how to assess students’ social and emotional development.

## EARLY CHILDHOOD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tool Name</th>
<th>Web Address</th>
<th>Developer</th>
<th>Other Ages/Grades Covered</th>
<th>Constructs Measured</th>
<th>Respondent and Format</th>
<th>Number of Items and Response Time</th>
<th>Cost Associated</th>
<th>Setting</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Achenbach System of Empirically Based Assessment (ASEBA)</strong></td>
<td><a href="http://www.asea.org">www.asea.org</a></td>
<td>Copyright © 2010 Thomas M. Achenbach, Research Center for Children, Youth, &amp; Families, One South Prospect Street, Burlington, VT 05401, USA. All rights reserved. Use, duplication, or disclosure by the United States Government is subject to the restrictions set forth in DFARS 252.227-7013(c)(1)(ii) and FAR 52.227-19.</td>
<td>Early childhood (0-5 years)</td>
<td>Adaptive functioning Syndrome: DSM-oriented substance use</td>
<td>Self, Family, Teacher/staff, Peer, Observation, Performance based, Other</td>
<td>99-120 items</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Classroom, Schoolwide, Afterschool, Other</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Additional School Climate and SEL Resources

- National Center on Safe and Supportive Learning Environments
  - Compendium of School Climate Surveys
  - US. Department of Education’s School Climate Surveys (EDSCLS)
  - School Improvement Resource Package
  - https://safesupportivelearning.ed.gov/

- GTL Center SEL School
  - Professional learning modules
  - Online learning modules
  - Teacher SEL Self-Assessment
  - Policy and practice briefs
  - www.gtlcenter.org/sel-school
Questions?
References


References


Susan Therriault, EdD
781-373-7007
stheirrault@air.org

Ryan Reyna
rreyna@edstrategy.org

David English
202-403-6930
denglish@air.org

Nicholas Yoder
nyoder@air.org

College and Career Readiness and Success Center
1000 Thomas Jefferson Street NW
Washington, DC 20007
800-634-0503
www.ccrsccenter.org | ccrsccenter@air.org